

Entrepreneurial feminism in Kigali: A social feminism and liberalism perspective

Simon Nsengimana

Doctor. Cape Peninsula University of Technology. South Africa. ORCID: [ORCID: 0000-0001-8330-1295](https://orcid.org/0000-0001-8330-1295).

Visvanathan Naicker

Professor. Cape Peninsula University of Technology. South Africa. ORCID: [ORCID: 0000-0003-0478-1329](https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0478-1329).

nsengasimon@yahoo.fr, naickervi@cput.ac.za.

Received: March 29, 2021.

Accepted: June 4, 2021.

Published: September 1, 2021.

Abstract

Entrepreneurship has been attributed to a masculine career in many economies. Rwanda was no exception to the discrimination of women in entrepreneurship. Due to gender, stereotype, and patriarchy, Rwandan women were not free in deciding to participate in entrepreneurial feminism. Some women became liberalists to break the glass ceiling to launch entrepreneurial feminism. They faced constraints that included a lack of entrepreneurship skills, market opportunity, and fear of failure. This article aimed to explore how gender affects new entrepreneurial feminism creation in Kigali. A quantitative approach used to collect survey data from 409 women-owned SMEs in Kigali were selected purposively. The findings indicated that most women-owned SMEs in Kigali started a necessary business due to unemployment. In contrast, those who needed time to care for their family while generating income launched the opportunity business. (64.3%) accepted permission from partners to start a business. While (24.9%) broke the glass ceiling. A lack of entrepreneurship skills was the major constraint they faced.

Key words

Entrepreneurial feminism; permission; constraint; glass ceiling; Kigali.

How to cite this article

Nsengimana, S., Naicker, V. (2021). Entrepreneurial feminism in Kigali: A social feminism and liberalism perspective. *Harvard Deusto Business Research*, X(2), 317-336.

<https://doi.org/10.48132/hdbr.323>.

1. Introduction

A simple explanation of entrepreneurial feminism is that it promotes feminist values through the process of creating ventures, to improve the position of women in society. Many reputable organizations, academia, and researchers agreed that the world is losing wealth due to the underrepresentation of females in the socio-economic mainstream of many developed and developing countries or paying females a lower salary compared to males for the same job performed (Amanda et al., 2019; Khadija et al., 2020; ILO, 2020). The latter may be attributed to gender stereotypes, patriarchy, cultural norms, and religious beliefs.

The International Labour Organisation (ILO) reported the global average that females paid are approximately 19% less than that of males for equal work (ILO, 2020). Sadly, employers take advantage of penalizing those women who have children, for instance, in Sub-Sahara Africa; they are paid 31% less than males (Khadija, V at al., 2020).

For many years, in developed and developing economies females were discriminated against for launching and running businesses instead of housekeeping activities, and Rwanda is no exception. Gender stereotypes, patriarchy, cultural norms, and religious beliefs oppressed Rwandan females in many socio-economic activities. Despite their entrepreneurial intention, those downsides mentioned above hamper females to execute their entrepreneurship talent. However, albeit with these obstacles, some of them launched entrepreneurial feminism.

Our core understanding is that submission and the breaking of the glass ceiling factors influenced the females' new enterprises' creation in Kigali. The submission refers to females who submitted to their husbands or male family member to request permission to start a business. Once, they received permission and started businesses they received various support including finance and business opportunities.

In contrast, the liberalists viewed that open and running businesses are absolute female rights, and there is no need to request permission for whoever follows government institution's regulation about launching a business. The liberalists, including those who were refused permission to launch businesses, broke the glass ceiling to open businesses. They may not receive the community support they deserved and we do not know why, but they operate their businesses under fear of failure.

This article aims to explore how gender affects new entrepreneurial feminism creation in Kigali. Thus, the question raised here is "How does gender affect female enterprise creation in Kigali"? To respond to the research question, our theoretical framework is based on feminism and liberalism theory toward gender inequality that stiffens women from embracing entrepreneurial feminism.

However, masculinity is also addressed in this article because it is the opposite of feminism, and it was used to oppress females. Besides this, there is no way to hide from government institutions as they set rules and regulations and monitor their implementation. Masculinity and government institutions appear in the length of the article.

The quantitative method design was used to gather cross-sectional survey data from a sample population of female-owned SMEs in Kigali. The data analyzed using the last SPSS version, 26. This study is necessary because it explores the influence of gender on entrepreneurial feminism.

It addresses the recommendation to overcome the negative constructs that hamper women's involvement in entrepreneurial activities in Kigali, Rwanda, and other developing economies. Those constructs only delay socio-economic development and the UN development agenda is to eradicate global poverty by 2035, and the African Union agenda is designed to achieve gender equality, eliminating poverty in African countries by 2060.

The researchers like United States Agency for International Development (USAID) (2015) and Hakuzimana (2017) focussed on gender analysis for USAID/Rwanda feed the future (FtF). No specific study looks at the impact of gender on entrepreneurial feminism in Kigali. Therefore, this article is essential to identify the role of gender in hampering females to enter the entrepreneurship industry in Kigali. The conclusion and recommendation can duplicate to other economies particularly in Sub-Saharan Africa because most gender issues are similar.

The terms female entrepreneurs and women-owned businesses; female and woman, male and men used synonymously. The rest of the article presented as following: entrepreneurial feminism, methodology, findings and discussion and, conclusion.

2. Entrepreneurial Feminism theory

Entrepreneurial feminism theory emerged from gender equality which creates an entrepreneurship gender gap. Women do not have the same opportunity to access resources compared to men. Integrating women into mainstream entrepreneurship may accelerate social-economic growth (Arora, 2019). This theory addresses the Liberalism theory and Social Feminism theory.

2.1. Liberal Feminism

Liberal Feminism (LF) is the main element of feminism; it is against gender inequality. LF presumes that females and males are equal; they must have some opportunities to access education, political position, work, and economic, among many more. Liberalists view patriarchy as the obstacle for female socio-politico-economic development. Patriarchy is a concept used to describe a females' male dominance from household to government and private sector institutions. Male dominant females in mainstream social-politic-economic create a huge socio-politic economic gender gap (Higgins, 2018).

Despite the persistence of gender inequality, Rwanda had amended the constitution to equalize female and male rights in all country life spheres, including entrepreneurship. This is supported by The World Bank (WB) and the World Trade Organization (WTO) (WTO, 2020).

Despite the liberalists' battle for gender parity, women are still underrepresented in entrepreneurship, and education is required regarding entrepreneurship courses such as sciences, engineering, and technology. Liberal Feminism suggests that by giving women the same opportunity as men, access to finance, education, supply chain, market opportunity, and other resources they may be equal with men in entrepreneurship and other social activities (Unger & Crawford, 1992; Arora, 2019).

Previous research reported that women entrepreneurs manage small-sized businesses compared to men, and due to gender inequality, they faced constraints including inadequate access to the resources, relevant education, economic, ICT, and many more. These constraints hamper their entrepreneurship success (Unger & Crawford, 1992; Chinomona & Maziriri, 2015; Kelley et al., 2017; Nsengimana et al. 2019). Liberal Feminism concurs that by relieving constraints from experienced women entrepreneurs, they could perform business equally like men or better than them (Orser & Elliott, 2015).

2.2. Social Feminism theory

Gender tends to be defined in the social field during sex in biology science. Gender refers to a role male or female plays in society. However, the definition of sex differentiates males and females based on Anatomy, Histology, Physiology, and Genetic factors (Newman, 2018). The social feminism theory assumes that women and men are created differently—their life experience, socialization, and how they view things differently.

Nevertheless, it does not mean that they are weak in entrepreneurship. Men and women have the same entrepreneurship characteristics. However, they differ from very few traits that could not affect their entrepreneurship performance (Fischer et al., 1993).

It is owing to the bottomless cultural reach of the experiential. The difference between females and males, androgyny is usually not considered to be feasible in SF. Nor is it considered desirable; the core principle of SF is that, while women's experience and reasoning have been belittled, their awareness can be conducive to similarly socially efficient behavior. SF argues that it is crucial to understand how knowledge is gendered and recognized that feminine knowledge is ignored or marginalized. This involves identifying both gender disparities and their consequences for individual behaviour and social well-being (Fischer et al., 1993).

Despite the role men and women play in society, the patriarchy and gender stereotype promote men over women and subordinate men. This gender inequality was applied as masculinity entrepreneurship, a male profession that explains why women are underrepresented in entrepreneurship. Lack of society and family support distress women entrepreneurs who impacted their businesses' growth and success (Vossenbergh, 2013). Gender stereotypes create a fear of failure and hold back women entrepreneurs (Orser & Elliott, 2015). However, the literature indicates that some women entrepreneurs boosted their businesses due to full support from husbands and male family members. They helped in performing housekeeping activities and business.

3. Entrepreneurial Feminism

Entrepreneurial feminism defines as “A mechanism to create economic self-sufficiency and equity-based outcomes for girls, Trans, queer women, and women-identified people. Entrepreneurial feminists enter commercial markets to create wealth and social change based on the ethics of cooperation, equality, and mutual respect” (Orser & Elliott, 2015).

Entrepreneurship is no longer a male career; women known as untapped economic forces embrace entrepreneurial feminism and strongly contribute to socio-economic development.

Worldwide women involved in entrepreneurial activities estimate 252 053 113. In the Total Entrepreneurial Activity (TEA), worldwide women represent around 10.2% which was about three-quarters of men's rate. 6.2% of women enterprises versus 9.5% of men enterprises were established. An established business is an enterprise aged 42 months and overperforms well. In contrast, TEA refers to nascent and new businesses less than 42 months of existence. Interestingly, in Sub-Sahara Africa, the start-up phase of venture creation, graduate females are approximately 30% more than graduates men (Amanda et al., 2019).

In terms of job creation, globally, 2.5% of women and 5% of men hired more than 20 workers each. Since women break the ceiling to penetrated entrepreneurship, they are globally active in a TEA at 53.4% versus 43.5 % for men. Their businesses concentrated in retail and wholesale. However, a considerable gap was identified in mining, modern agriculture, and ICT which were captured by men entrepreneurs; they are twice as women in those industries. Concerning opportunities, gender inequality and gender stereotype hamper women entrepreneurs to grab opportunities; this is why males control 47.3% of opportunities compared to 42.1% for female entrepreneurs. Remarkably, global, an average of 64.25% of female entrepreneurs support their families versus their counterpart men 51.9%. However, Sub-Saharan Africa women invest more in their families, around 70% (Amanda et al., 2019).

3.1. Rwanda entrepreneurial feminism

As mentioned in the introduction that gender stereotypes, patriarchy, cultural norms, and religious beliefs were responsible for lower female contribution to entrepreneurship in Rwanda, and Kigali the study site. It is essential to summarise how these factors affect entrepreneurial feminism in Rwanda.

A gender stereotype is a generalized view or preconception about attributes or characteristics, or the roles that are or ought to be possessed by, or performed by women and men. A gender stereotype is harmful when it limits women's and men's capacity to develop their abilities, pursue their professional careers, and make choices about their lives (United Nations Human Rights, 2020).

Therefore, there is vast gender inequality in Rwanda, particularly in Kigali, where most businesses belong to male entrepreneurs who also capture public and private procurement. This is due to the Rwandan society underestimating woman's ability to run and grow a business. However, there is no scientific evidence to confirm women's inability to manage the business, supply, and learning (Byanafashe et al., 2011; North Carolina State University, 2018). Patriarchy has been debated in liberal feminism above.

Culture refers to norms, beliefs, customs, and ideas to guide a particular society. However, most of the disadvantages Rwandan women face stem from cultural norms (Mbabazi, 2018). Cultural norms still challenge women when opening a business; they must first ask permission from the family or husband to start and run a business. Lack of family support stops many women's entrepreneurship ambitions (Muhoza, 2019).

The Rwandan is a people who practice religious beliefs. They believe that women must be subordinate to men who are the breadwinners, making it difficult for women to run a business. In Rwanda around the 1900's, teaching and learning were challenged by the Catholic missionaries who discriminated against females from education. However, education is the catalyst of

enterprise creation and success. Byanafashe (2006) reported that girls waited for 32 years after boys attend secondary schools in 1950. Sadly, they were only allowed to study nursing and midwives, social work, and primary teaching. Fellman (2012) adds that it took nine years for girls after boys to attend primary school. The Catholic church and colonizers promoted women's discrimination in education and the country's mainstream economy, which the consequences thereof remain today (Fellman, 2012).

Despite the impact of a gender stereotype, patriarchy, cultural norms, and religious beliefs, Rwanda. National Institute of Statistics of Rwanda (NISR) Indicates that women represent around 33% of formal businesses. Despite this portion, the businesses are small-scale compared to those of their male counterpart. Despite their background, their efforts were appreciated by many stakeholders as an engine of socio-economic development. However, females must embrace medium and large businesses to ensure their sustainability and equality among women and men (USAID, 2009; Rwanda. National Institute of Statistics of Rwanda, 2018).

66.4% of females involved in farming businesses versus 53.5 males. However, 5.5 % run businesses no related to farming opposite to 11.2% males. In terms of access to formal credit, patriarchy remaining, males receive credit two times than females; thus, only 5.7% of females versus 11.4% accessed formal credit by 2015. As a result, 41.4% of females versus 38.7% of males accessed informal credit by 2015. Depressing, 9.5% of females do not contribute to any economic activity, only housekeeping activities versus 3.2% males (Rwanda. National Institute of Statistics, 2016).

3.2 Female enterprises in Kigali

As indicated above, how gender stereotypes, patriarchy, cultural norms, and religious beliefs impact entrepreneurial feminism in Rwanda, Kigali is no exception. Kigali is the economical and administration city of Rwanda. The nature of business in Kigali differs from those of a rural area based on farming. In Kigali, women appear in various businesses but concentrate on retail and services. Many of them penetrated entrepreneurial activities after requesting permission from their partners or male heads of the family for single females. In contrast, others break the glass ceiling to exercise entrepreneurship as it is their right according to the Rwanda constitution (Naicker & Nsengimana, 2020).

In Kigali, many women are unemployed; they could not find jobs in the public and private sectors, entrepreneurship is a quick option to earn money to support their families. Another hypothesis was that men breadwinners failed to provide the necessary for their families; they called their spouses to embrace entrepreneurship to care for them (Hakuzimana, 2017). Despite the way women started a business, they faced challenges.

3.3. Entrepreneurial Feminism challenges

Females and males may face common challenges, but females have specific challenges linked with a gender stereotype, patriarchy, cultural norms, and religious beliefs. In this article, we called them gender inequality challenges and the first one under discussion is gender disparity.

There is vast gender inequality in Rwanda, where most businesses belong to male entrepreneurs. This is due to the Rwandan society underestimating woman's ability to run and grow a business. There is no scientific evidence to confirm a women's inability to manage the business (Byanafashe, et al., 2011). Awarding public and private tenders to women in supply chain management will increase women's involvement in the mainstream economy. However, calling them to contribute fully in mainstream economic business without privileges will continue to keep them engaged in informal and small-sized businesses in Kigali (Pro-Femmes Twese Hamwe, 2019).

Most of the disadvantages Rwandan women encounter are from cultural norms. They must first ask permission from the family or husband to start a business. However, those who break the glass ceiling, work under cultural norms and pressure that impact their performance and growth. Some male consumers are still conservative, and they do not buy products or services from women when they can find it from men-owned businesses. The Rwandan cultural norms challenge women in the business environment while men do not embrace integrating women in entrepreneurship. In Rwanda, suppliers prioritize men entrepreneurs. Some married women complain of not having full control and decision-making in their businesses. Their husbands still wear cultural clothing to decide how the business should be run (Brooks, 2018; Muhoza, 2019).

Given the opportunity for women like men to access finances may help them grow their businesses, improve their competitiveness, market share, increase GDP, and close the financial inclusion gap. Lack of access to finance means that women SMEs will continue to suffer financially, and this may result in them remaining small-sized enterprises (Rukundo, 2015). The FinScope Rwanda (2016) report indicated that women are at a disadvantage in accessing finance in terms of financial inclusion in Rwanda compared to men. A higher percentage of women (13%) do not access any finance form than 9% of men. Most women use an informal loan to run businesses. This form of loan is not guaranteed, and most of the time, it is short and demands higher interest.

Negating mobility of women-owned SMEs in Kigali exposes their businesses to becoming uncompetitive. The Rwandan culture attributes women to housekeeping tasks. Women are not allowed to travel during the night to take advantage, for example of milk distribution which the transport must be done during the night under the pretext of home responsibility. Refusing women's mobility retains the gender inequality gap. It keeps women running only small-sized enterprises. It also negatively impacts their businesses as they are forced to buy expensive inventory from distributors and wholesalers from which they make very little profit. It benefits men entrepreneurs and enhances entrepreneurship and the gender inequality gap (Blackden et al., 2011; Mukamana et al., 2017).

Sexual harassment traced back to gender stereotypes, where men dominate women, and men continue the same behavior in the workplace and business environment (Tashobya, 2016). Many females that have been harassed prefer to keep quiet instead of saying what happened to them as they fear not being believed and rejected in society (Transparency Rwanda, 2011). Despite the Law N°59/2008 of 10/09/18 punishing those who are involved in sexual harassment, culture still confines Rwandan women; they keep quiet when harassed (Rwanda, 2008). Other constraints

many females facing running businesses in Kigali are finance, government, education and training, and fear of failure.

4. Methodology

Rwanda's Kigali administrative and economic capital was selected because various businesses are contrary to rural areas where most businesses are related to farming. This may show a picture of entrepreneurial feminism in Kigali and how some industries are remaining in masculinity. The sample population meets the following criteria. Females, 18 years of age and older, Rwandan citizen and foreign nationals, speaking Kinyarwanda or English, a business must be one month old and older, a business must be SMEs, a business must be located in the city of Kigali (Gasabo, Kicukiro, and Nyarugenge District), and business must be in the importation, exportation, wholesale, retail, ICT, manufacturing, transport, agriculture, construction, and service sectors.

The purposive method was used to select the sample population. Based on the researchers' judgment, they believed that they selected the appropriate unit of analysis to provide quality data. Due to the lack of statistics for women enterprises in Kigali, the Raosoft sample size calculator was used to determine the sample size 377 of women-owned SMEs in Kigali contributed in the survey (Hightower & Scott, 2012).

4.1. Survey method and instrument

The personal survey used a structured questionnaire to gather data from respondents. In the personal survey, the researcher interacts face to face with respondents. Researchers asked questions to respondents and recorded answers on a google form. Respondents were free to ask clarity to questions they do not understand well. Google form contained a questionnaire in a tablet connected to the internet. Google forms have the benefit of avoiding articlework; data recorded electronically and served on google driver. Data coding, capturing, and cleaning is done automatically. Google Forms also can download data on an Excel sheet which was analyzed using SPSS, 26 version. 409 questionnaires were collected contrary to 377 were programmed that increase the reliability of data and representative of the population.

Demographic data was collected. The business profile data was gathered to gain insight into women's businesses in Kigali. It was also necessary to collect data to investigate the stimulus toward entrepreneurial feminism and whether they requested permission to start a business. From that data, we can differentiate those who submitted (i.e. submission to their husbands) versus those who broke the glass ceiling. Lastly, data was gathered to identify the challenges they face and their gravity.

5. Data analysis and findings

The data presented and discussed were the socio-demographic data and the business profile data. Besides, the stimulus of entrepreneurial intention among entrepreneurs in Kigali; request

for permission to launch a business, and feminism constraints to women-owned businesses in Kigali are discussed.

5.1. Socio-demographic and the business profile findings

The findings indicated that (79.5%) of respondents surveyed were married, (60.6%) stayed with partners. Almost three quarter (73.8%) fell within the age range of 25-44 years. As far as education is concerned, secondary and primary education dominated (97.2%). A significant number of them (88.9%) were Rwandan nationals. The majority (57.7%) of respondents seemed to be unemployed before launching their businesses.

The objective of this section was to have insight into women's SMEs in Kigali. The findings showed that (90.7%) of respondents had no education which was related to business studies i.e. such as entrepreneurship. The same was true of (89.7%) who did not practice entrepreneurship. However, just (9.5%) had internships with various organizations before they began their businesses. The training enhanced their management skills in numerous disciplines, including entrepreneurship, administration, and accounting. The majority (97.8%) of respondents were sole proprietorships, and (58.8%) offered services. Most of their businesses, (54.5%) were between one and five years old. They received start-up funding from their savings (23.5%); husbands (22.7%), and family (15.1%) which indicates that it was difficult for them to secure a loan from a formal lender to start a business. About (65.2%) reported that they started their businesses from scratch, and (90.5%) reported that their customers were citizens of Kigali. It was found that a majority (88.3 %) of the respondents' businesses performed well.

5.2. The stimulus of female entrepreneurial intention

Reasons were sought to determine why female entrepreneurs were inspired to launch businesses in Kigali. Both causes may be push factors that inspire an entrepreneur to launch a necessary business or pull factors that encourage an entrepreneur to launch an opportunity business. Table 1 below offers statistics on the diverse reasons that led females in Kigali to venture into entrepreneurship.

Table1 above indicates that (57.4%,) of respondents run entrepreneurial feminism due to unemployment. A possible motive for launching businesses was to earn income to fulfill their needs. Those who are educated may join the workforce if they find a job on the labor market. Referring to Table1, females involved in entrepreneurial feminism in Kigali necessity (76%) and opportunity (24%) entrepreneurs. Necessity ones were unemployed; faced termination of the contract; not skilled to pursue employment; experienced mistreatment in the workplace; suffered job dissatisfaction; divorced or breakup, and death of spouse and refugee. They started survival businesses with difficulty finding capital start-ups. Kelley et al. (2011) and Fairlie and Fossen (2017) reported that a miserable financial situation pushed necessity entrepreneurs into business to survive. Their businesses are small with a meager income.

Table 1

Motives to start a female business in Kigali

	Frequency	Percent
Push factors (necessity entrepreneurs)		
Unemployment	234	57.4
Maltreatment where I worked	10	2.5
Job dissatisfactions	24	5.9
Divorce or separation	13	3.2
Death of husband	4	1.0
Unwanted pregnancy	0	0
Refugee	1	0.2
I am not educated to find a job in the labor market	10	2.5
My contract with my employer terminated	14	3.4
Pull factors (opportunity entrepreneurs)		
Independence	12	2.9
Fulfilment my entrepreneur intention	6	1.5
Self-actualization	25	6.1
Innovation	9	2.2
I needed time to care for my family while generating income	29	7.1
I needed to generate more revenue	6	1.5
Education, training, and experience	3	0.7
Challenge men by showing them that women can also start and run a successful business	8	2.0
Total	408	100.0

Source: Own elaboration.

Opposite to opportunity entrepreneurs, as shown in Table 1, are those that challenge males by proving that females are also able to launch and run a sustainable business. They are educated, trained, and experienced; they shape the entrepreneur's intention; they want time to take care of the family when producing income; they desire to produce more revenue; independence; innovation, and self-fulfillment.

Opportunity entrepreneurs are financially stable. They launched a business to earn more than their salaries in the workplace and to improve their visibility and dominance. They perceived and pursued an opportunity; they could finance the start-up and the growth stage of a business lifestyle that differentiate them from necessity entrepreneurs who struggle financially to set up a

business (Kelley et al., 2011; Fairlie & Fossen, 2017). The next findings revealed whether women-owned SMEs in Kigali requested permission or not to start a business.

5.3. Request for permission to launch a business

The objective of these findings is to determine whether women-owned SMEs in Kigali requested permission from partners or male relatives to start a business. This finding reveals to what extent gender stereotypes and patriarchy affect women's entrepreneurial feminism creation. As indicated in the literature, submission (request permission to start a business) and to break the glass ceiling (liberalism behaviors to start a business) influenced women-owned SMEs' execution in Kigali entrepreneurial intention, ultimately, launching new ventures. Those who refused permission and those who did not request both considered liberalists break the glass ceiling to start businesses. They fought for their rights; no one could stop their entrepreneurial intention. Referring to Table 2 below, another factor raised "husband's initiative". All these scenarios are discussed below.

Table 2 indicates that married women (55.5%) and single ones (8.8%) were the majority (64.3%) of respondents who were loyal to their partners and family. They believed that women could not decide to start a business; they must submit to a partner or family for single females to request permission to start entrepreneurial feminism. Luckily, they received approbation from the partners and families to go ahead with the launch of enterprises.

They might receive other supports like financial, psychology, physical, and perform some housekeeping activities attributed to female jobs, and they can help them run businesses. Female entrepreneurs feel comfortable, supported, and have increased morale that could affect business performance. As discussed above (37.8%) of a capital start-up from partners and families is evident that this group of women entrepreneurs received full package support from their partners and families.

In line with the current findings, earlier studies by Vossenberg (2013) and Wolf and Frese (2018) have shown that the physical, psychological, and resourceful husbands and families help inspire women's businesses, which affect their market success and development. Some women refused permission to start a business; they revolted, opened the business to realize their dreams.

Table 2 indicates that (3.4%) of respondents were disappointed, partners (2.2%) and families (1.2%) heard their request to start entrepreneurial feminism but in vain. Despite the trust they had in them, they become liberalists, changing the way of thinking and projection that arrived to conclude that no one could stop their right attributed by government institutions, they joined those who break the glass ceiling (24.9%) to exercise their right.

Table 2

Request permission to start a business

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Missing values	5	1,2	1,2	1,2

327

Accepted permission				
I asked permission, and my husband was supportive	227	55,5	55,5	56.7
I asked permission from my family, and they were supportive (single)	36	8,8	8,8	65.5
Refused permission				
I asked permission, but my husband was not supportive	9	2,2	2,2	67.7
I asked for permission from my family, but they were not supportive (single)	5	1,2	1,2	68.9
Break glass ceiling				
I did not ask permission	77	18,8	18,8	87.7
No husband, I made the decision myself (widow)	14	3,4	3,4	91.1
I did not ask for permission from my family (single)	11	2,7	2,7	93.8
Husband initiative				
It was my husband proposition	25	6,1	6,1	100
Total	409	100,0	100,0	

Source: Own elaboration.

The liberalism theory attributes gender stereotypes and patriarchy responsible for gender inequality. These women, seek equality between men and women in all spheres of the country live, they stand up together to say no to gender inequality in entrepreneurship. Even though liberalist is individual, but they share the common issue. Despite their effort to set themselves free to penetrate entrepreneurial feminism, they may not receive support compared to the previous group who received permission to start a business. The community may see them as rebellions. As a result, they run a business in fear of failure.

This result aligned with that of Orser and Elliott (2015); Essa (2018), and Kamberidou (2020) who found that certain women had broken the glass ceiling and asserted their right to freely engage in the country's activities as their male counterparts. They started entrepreneurial feminism. Notwithstanding the gender stereotyping and patriarchal climate, the obstacles they face, but their enterprises are making progress.

The results in Table 2 show (6.1%) of women-owned SMEs in Kigali penetrated feminist entrepreneurship, not for their will but their husbands' initiative. Perhaps, they did not have an entrepreneurial intention; they needed employment in the public or private sector. Despite the definition of gender stereotype cited earlier, the husbands chose them and directed them on what to do. What was behind their husbands' initiative? They possibly failed to provide families with the needs; they could raise more families' income if wives run businesses that could improve their families' welfare. It seems that this group of females entrepreneurs received full package support from their partners compared to other groups. Their businesses may perform well and sustainably.

Vossenbergh (2016); Wolf and Frese (2018) stated that a husband's support catalyses a females enterprise's performance and growth. This is because the partners help their wives perform some house activities and advice and help them in their entrepreneurial activities that boost female entrepreneurs' morale and decrease the fear of failure. Despite the climate females launched enterprises in Kigali, they also face feminism challenges.

5.4. Feminism constrains women-owned businesses

The objective of this section was to identify the amplitude of the challenge they face in doing business in Kigali. The challenges were the majority that agreed with the statement over (50%). These were a lack of entrepreneurial skills, lack of market opportunities, lack of education and training as a constraint, inability to obtain public tenders, lack of information technology skills (e.g. internet), and fear of failure.

Table 3 indicates that most of the respondents, (77.04%), lack entrepreneurship skills, followed by (17.28%) who were neutral on the statement. The disadvantaged background of women who needed to gain an education was experiencing a lack of various skills including entrepreneurship skills (Byanafashe et al., 2011).

The majority of respondents surveyed, (97.2%) have completed primary and secondary education. Despite entrepreneurship courses on the secondary program, it can be argued that the entrepreneurship course maybe not relevant and needed to be updated with relevant skills to enable women-owned SMEs in Kigali to compete, share the market and improve their business performance. Global Entrepreneurship Monitor 2016/2017 Report on Women's Entrepreneurship revealed that the general entrepreneurship program had shown a weakness to improve women entrepreneurship capacity building rather than specific skills to have positioned women in enterprises (Kelley et al., 2017). The above finding is consistent with World Bank (2019), who found that a lack of entrepreneurship skills among women entrepreneurs was a common challenge faced by women-owned businesses in the Africa continent.

Table 3

Feminism challenges faced women entrepreneurs in Kigali

Statement	Disagree (%)	Neutral (%)	Agree (%)
-----------	--------------	-------------	-----------

Lack of entrepreneurial skills is a constraint	5.67	17.28	77.04
Lack of market opportunities is a constraint	9.34	19.41	71.25
Lack of education and training is a constraint	15.20	15.93	68.87
Inability to obtain public tender is a constraint	15.73	16.22	68.06
Lack of information technology skills (e.g. internet) is a constraint	17.40	22.06	60.54
Fear of failure is a constraint	25.06	17.94	57.00
Inability to travel because of family/husband obligations	31.3	26.41	42.30
Collateral to obtain a loan is a constraint	42,33	20.05	37.62
Sexual harassment is a constraint	43.60	25.37	31.04
Lack of a support network is a constraint	62.10	10.27	27.63
It is difficult for women to access finance	74.20	17.69	8.11
Customs and local culture disadvantage women to operate a business	84.31	12.75	0.74
Being a woman is a negative factor in business	93.38	6.13	0.49
There is gender inequality in business	98.52	1.23	0.25

Source: Own elaboration.

The results reveal that (71.25%) of respondents surveyed showed a lack of market opportunities that was a constraint they experienced. A lack of education, ultimately entrepreneurship skills, affected their abilities to identify opportunities. Even though there are local and international business opportunities, men entrepreneurs are favored by entrepreneurship skills, experiences, masculinity, and stable finances to grab any perceived opportunity. Society still underestimates women's ability to exploit an opportunity (Rwirahira, 2018). This is in good agreement with Independent Online (2018) who reported that a lack of identification of opportunities was among the significant constraints faced by South-African women entrepreneurs due to inadequate finance, training, and development programs for females support.

Table 3 indicates that the majority (68.87%) of respondents agreed that a lack of education and training was a constraint challenge women-owned SMEs in Kigali. However, (15.20%) of respondents were shaped with education and training. While (15.93%) of respondents were neutral.

These findings are not surprising, females were discriminated against from proper education, and boys were privileged to attend schools. Since females were allowed schooling, their education focussed on particular courses like education and social nursing work. Nowadays, very few women attend sciences, engineering, and technology in tertiary education (Byanafashe, 2006). These courses were acknowledged as a catalyst of creativity and innovation which make entrepreneurship healthily.

Chinomona & Maziriri (2015) observed low creativity and innovation among women entrepreneurship in Gauteng of South Africa due to lack of sciences, engineering, technology education, and training. Lack of education and training hamper women to embrace small, medium, and large enterprises. This why most women enterprises in Kigali were micro-enterprises (Rwanda. National Institute of Statistics of Rwanda, 2018).

Choto et al. (2014) stated that education is the source of business performance and growth. Rwigema et al. (2008) observed the relationship between education and level of business. The well-educated entrepreneurs tend to conduct small, medium, and large businesses, while the less educated focus on micro-businesses and informal businesses.

From Rwigema et al. (2008) perspective, our interest is that since (97,2%) of respondents completed secondary and primary schooling justified why many women businesses in Kigali were micro-enterprises. These findings are in line with Chinomona & Maziriri (2015) findings that a lack of education and training was a challenge faced by women entrepreneurs in Gauteng of South Africa that affects their business performance.

As shown in Table 3 above, (68.06%) of respondents had challenges obtaining a public tender. In contrast, (15.73%) of respondents obtained public tender. At the same time, (16.22%) of respondents were neutral on the statement. Lack of entrepreneurship skills, education, and training running micro-enterprises, and insufficient capital affected the possibility of obtaining public tender. It is difficult to compete with their counterparts who complete the requirements needed to win a public tender (Transparency Rwanda, 2011). Interestingly, (15.73%) of respondents have succeeded in a public tender; they won some public tenders.

The South African president, Mr. Cyril Ramaphosa, believed that there was no sustainable socio-economic development since women could not participate in the mainstream economy of South Africa. He recognized their difficulties to grab opportunities in the public supply chain, and the government set aside (40%) of a public tender to women entrepreneurs. Furthermore, they can improve their businesses, move forward to embrace the small, medium, and large businesses (Independent Online, 2020). Rwanda's government should learn from South Africa's best practice to award a certain percentage of a public tender to women entrepreneurs. Perhaps (50%) of females represent around (51%) of the Rwandan population (Rwanda. National Institute of Statistics of Rwanda, 2018).

Table 3 shows that (60.54%) of respondents experienced a lack of information technology skills. They could not leverage communication tools such as the internet of things and cell phones to promote their business and communicate with the network. However, (17.40%) familiar with ICT skills and adopted ICT into their businesses. Almost a quarter (22.06%) of the respondents were uncertain.

These findings are not surprising as the gender digital divide was identified in Rwandan society (Rwanda. National Institute of Statistics, 2016). Nowadays, ICT skills are compulsory to run a business and enable them to compete in the marketplace. Lack of ICT skills holds businesses incompetent. It is suggested that empowering women with relevant ICT skills related to business could shift them from running a traditional business to a modern one and to become competitive (Bishumba, 2017). These findings collaborate with those in Global Entrepreneurship Monitor 2018/2019 Women's Entrepreneurship Report (Amanda et al., 2019) who reported that a lack of ICT skills was a common issue in his many countries members.

Table 3 indicates that (57%) of respondents faced the fear of failure constraint. Opposite to (25.06%) who were confident of themselves, running a business free of the fear of failure. However, (17.94%) of the respondents were uncertain. These findings are disappointing, the majority of women-owned SMEs in Kigali run a business under the pressure of failure. As discussed above in the section and shown in Table 2, some women started businesses after requesting their partners' or families' permission. Failure for them means that they disappointed those who allow them to run a business. Simultaneously, those who break the glass ceiling exercise the entrepreneurial activities work under fear of failure; they need to prove their ability to run a successful business like their counterpart men. Some women-owned SMEs in Kigali are the breadwinners; they experienced a fear of failure to provide the families if they failed. These findings are in line with the Global Entrepreneurship Monitor 2018/2019 Women's Entrepreneurship Report found that many women entrepreneurs would shift from entrepreneurship to work in public and private sectors if they found employment instead of running business which put them under fear of failure pressure (Amanda et al., 2019).

6. Conclusion

This article aimed to explore how gender affects new entrepreneurial feminism creation in Kigali. Females are not free to start a business; the Rwanda patriarchy suggests that females must ask permission to partner with a male member of their family to venture into entrepreneurship. However, the liberalists view that women should start a business and not request permission from whoever, comply with government regulation regarding business.

The findings indicated that most women-owned SMEs in Kigali started a necessary business due to unemployment; entrepreneurship was a quick option to generate income to survive. In contrast, women who wanted time to take care of their families while producing revenue dominated the group of opportunities entrepreneurs. Push factors relating to the necessity entrepreneurs overshadowed the pull factors linked to opportunity entrepreneurs. These results reflect those of Fatoki (2014) who also found that unemployment was a significant factor that pushed women under 35 years to launch SMEs in Polokwane and Mankweng in the Limpopo province of South Africa.

Despite the push and pull factors to launch entrepreneurial feminism, most women-owned SMEs in Kigali had to request permission from partners or male family members to start an enterprise.

In contrast, some break the glass ceiling to excise entrepreneurial activities without requesting permission.

Despite requesting or not permission to start businesses, they faced constraints originated from gender inequality. The most significant constraint was a shortage of entrepreneurial skills. This was accompanied by a lack of market opportunities, a lack of education and training, inability to obtain public tenders, lack of information technology skills (e.g., Internet), and fear of failure.

Remarkably, gender inequality and access to finance were not constraints confronting women-owned SMEs in Kigali. These findings are contrary to those by the Global Entrepreneurship Monitor 2016/2017 Report on Women's Entrepreneurship who found that access to finance and gender inequality were among the challenges women-owned SMEs faced in over a hundred countries members of Global Entrepreneur Monitor (Kelley et al., 2017).

This study adds to the growing body of research that indicates how gender affects female new enterprise creation in Kigali. This study identified the constraints related to gender encountered by women-owned SMEs in Kigali. It could serve as a foundation that policymakers and stakeholders could use to find sustainable solutions to constraints linked to gender faced by women entrepreneurs not only in Kigali, Rwanda but in other developing economies.

This study endorsed the recommendation that Rwandan society should be taught about entrepreneurial feminism to set free women to make themselves the decision to launch a venture. Entrepreneurship programs should be updated with relevant skills to enable entrepreneurs to cope with the business environment challenges.

It was difficult for women-owned SMEs in Kigali to obtain a public tender. The government should follow the best practice of South Africa, which award 40% of government procurement to women entrepreneurs (Independent Online, 2020). The Rwandan government should do so by bringing women entrepreneurs to the public supply chain by providing them at least 50% of public tender as they make up 51% of the Rwandan population.

The findings indicated that women in Kigali engaged in entrepreneurial activities due to a lack of another source of income. A future study could explore the reasons why women do not consider entrepreneurship as a career path.

The authors declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article. The authors received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

7. References

- Amanda, B. E., Brush, P., & Greene, B. B. (2019). *Global Entrepreneurship Monitor 2018/2019 Women's Entrepreneurship Report*. Boston: Global Entrepreneurship Monitor.
- Arkkelin, D. (2014). Using SPSS to understand research and data analysis. 17 November. Retrieved from: http://scholar.valpo.edu/psych_oer/1.

- Arora, P. (2019). Gender inclusive trade and the limits of liberal feminism. June 2020. Retrieved from <https://voelkerrechtsblog.org/gender-inclusive-trade-and-the-limits-of-liberal-feminism/>.
- Blackden, M., Munganyinka, T., Mirembe, J., & Mugabe, A. S. (2011). *USAID/Rwanda gender assessment* (2011). Kigali: United States Agency for International Development.
- Bishumba, N. (2017). Poor technology hindering rural women entrepreneurship – study. June 2019. Retrieved from <https://www.newtimes.co.rw/section/read/209731>.
- Brooks, L. (2018). Why are there so few women entrepreneurs in Rwanda? 23 May. Retrieved from <https://womenentrepreneurgrowglobal.org/2018/07/30/why-are-there-so-few-women-entrepreneurs-in-rwanda/>.
- Bryman, A. (2012). *Social research methods*. Oxford: Oxford University.
- Byanafashe, D. (2006). The teaching of history of Rwanda a participatory approach: A resource book for teachers. Berkeley: University of California.
- Byanafashe, D., Rutayisire, P., Jyoni wa Kirenga, J., Kabwete Murinda, C., Kanimba Misago, C., & Mbonimana, G. (2011). *Histoire du Rwanda: Des orinines a la fin du XXe Sciecle*. Huye: Universite Nationale Du Rwanda.
- Chinomona, E., & Maziriri, E. T. (2015). Women In Action: Challenges Facing Women Entrepreneurs In The Gauteng Province Of South Africa. *International Business & Economics Research Journal*, 14(6), 835- 850.
- Choto, P., Tengeh, R., & Iwu, C. (2014). Daring to survive or to grow? The growth aspirations and challenges of survivalist entrepreneurs in South Africa. *Environmental Economics*, 5(4), 93-101.
- Dudovskiy, J. (2019). Research Methodology. 28 June. Retrieved from <https://research-methodology.net/sampling-in-primary-data-collection/purposive-sampling/#:~:text=Purposive%20sampling%20is%20a%20non,and%20money%E2%80%9D.%5B1%5D>.
- Essa, A. (2018). The politics of second-hand clothes: A debate over 'dignity'. Retrieved June 2, 2019, from: <https://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/features/politics-hand-clothes-debate-dignity-181005075525265.html>.
- Fairlie, R. W., & Fossen. M. (2017). *Opportunity versus necessity entrepreneurship: Two components of business creation*. Stanford: Stanford Institute for Economic Policy Research.
- Fatoki, O. (2014). Factors motivating young South African women to become entrepreneurs. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences*, 5(16), 184-190.
- Fellman, A. C. (2012). Focus on Rwanda: A Conference on gender research and activism: *Proceedings*. Kigali: SRIA Rwanda.
- FinScope Rwanda. (2016). *Financial inclusion in Rwanda 2016*. Kigali: FinScope Rwanda.
- Fischer, E., Reuber, R., & Dyke, L. (1993). A theoretical overview and extension of research on sex, gender, and entrepreneurship. *Journal of Business Venturing*, 8(2), 151-168.
- Hakuzimana, D. (2017). Specific problems of female entrepreneurs in Northern Province of Rwanda-Musanze District. *International Journal of Scientific and Research Publications*, 7(6), 283-291.
- Higgins, C. (2018). The age of patriarchy: How an unfashionable idea became a rallying cry for feminism today. 16 November. Retrieved from:

<https://www.theguardian.com/news/2018/jun/22/the-age-of-patriarchy-how-an-unfashionable-idea-became-a-rallying-cry-for-feminism-today>.

- Hightower, C., & Scott, K. (2012). Infer more, describe less: More powerful survey conclusions through easy inferential tests. *Issues in Science and Technology Librarianship*, 69, 1-22.
- Independent Online. (2018). Women entrepreneurs making headway in SA - Mastercard. 9 February. Retrieved from: <https://www.iol.co.za/business-report/companies/women-entrepreneurs-making-headway-in-sa-mastercard-13655652>.
- Independent Online. (2020). 40% of public procurement to be reserved for women-owned businesses. 9 August. Retrieved from: <https://www.iol.co.za/news/40-of-public-procurement-to-be-reserved-for-women-owned-businesses-448d041a-0801-42a9-b285-533583b9ecc6>.
- International Labour Organisation. (2020). Global Wage Report 2018/19. 14 November. Retrieved from: https://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/multimedia/maps-and-charts/enhanced/WCMS_650829/lang--en/index.htm.
- Kamberidou, I. (2020). "Distinguished" women entrepreneurs in the digital economy and the multitasking whirlpool. *Journal of Innovation and Entrepreneurship*, 9(1), 1-26.
- Kelley, D. J., Baumer, B. S., Brush, C., Greene, P. G., Mahdavi, M., Majbourni, M., & Heavlow, R. (2017). *Global Entrepreneurship Monitor 2016/2017 report on women's entrepreneurship*. Boston: Global Entrepreneurship Monitor.
- Kelley, D. J., Candida, G., Brush, Patricia, G., Greene, & Litovsky, Y. (2011). *2010 report: women entrepreneurs worldwide executive*. Babson: Global Entrepreneurship Monitor.
- Khadija, V.D.S.; Straaten.; Pisani, N.; & Kolk, A. (2020). *Why do multinationals pay women less in developing countries?* Geneva: World Economic Forum.
- Mbabazi, D. (2018). Why women in business are on the lighter side of the seesaw. May 2019. Retrieved from: <https://www.newtimes.co.rw/lifestyle/women-business-seesaw>.
- Muhoza, C. (2019). Feminism, radical feminism, and gender equality. 23 May. Retrieved from: <https://www.newtimes.co.rw/lifestyle/feminism-radical-feminism-and-gender-equality>.
- Mukamana, L., Sengendo, M., & Okiria, E. (2017). Control over the utilization of the loan and the pattern of the gendered division of labor in the loan-funded activity: A case of Duterimbere MFI in Rwanda. *Cogent Social Sciences*, 3(1), 1-25.
- Newman, T. (2018). Sex and gender: What is the difference? May 2019. Retrieved from: <https://www.medicalnewstoday.com/articles/232363.php>.
- Nsengimana, S., Iwu, C. G., & Tengeh, R. K. (2019). The Factors contributing to the low numbers of women entrepreneurs in Kigali. *Acta Universitatis Danubius. Œconomica*, 15(6), 97-113.
- Orser, B., & Elliott, C. (2015). *Feminine Capital: Unlocking the power of women entrepreneurs*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Pro-Femmes /Twese Hamwe. (2019). Gender Equality and Women Empowerment Project (GEWEP II). 23 May. Retrieved from: http://www.profemmes.org/spip.php?page=programmes&id_article=23.
- Rukundo, J. (2015). Understanding informal sector employment in Rwanda. *International Review of Research in Emerging Markets and the Global Economy*, 1(2), 295-309.
- Rwanda. (2008). Law N°59/2008 OF 10/09/2008 on prevention and punishment of gender-based violence. Kigali: Government Gazette.
- Rwanda. (2015). *Rwanda's Constitution*. Kigali: Government Gazette.

- Rwanda. National Institute of Statistics. (2016). National gender statistics report. Kigali: National Institute of Statistics of Rwanda.
- Rwanda. National Institute of Statistics of Rwanda. (2018). Establishments census. Kigali: National Institute of Statistics of Rwanda.
- Rwigema, H., Urban, B., & Venter, R. (2008). *Entrepreneurship theory in practice*. Cape Town: Oxford University Press.
- Rwirahira, R. (2018). How Rwanda's government hinders female entrepreneurs. 1 November. Retrieved from: <https://psmag.com/social-justice/how-rwanda-is-stopping-female-entrepreneurs>.
- Tashobya, A. (2016). Sexual harassment a challenge in the service industry. 16 May. Retrieved from: <https://www.newtimes.co.rw/section/read/196392>.
- Transparency Rwanda. (2011). *Gender-based corruption in workplaces in Rwanda*. Kigali: Transparency Rwanda.
- Unger, R. K., & Crawford, M. (1992). *Women and gender: A feminist psychology*. Washington, DC: Temple University.
- United Nations Human Rights. (2020). Gender stereotyping. 16 November. Retrieved November 16, 2020. Retrieved from <https://www.ohchr.org/en/issues/women/wrgs/pages/genderstereotypes.aspx>.
- United States Agency for International Development. (2015). Gender Analysis for USAID/Rwanda Feed the Future (FtF) Project. 2 July. Retrieved from: <https://www.usaid.gov/sites/default/files/documents/1860/GA%20-%20FtF%20-%20FINAL%20December%2014%202015%20-%20Public%20Version.pdf>.
- Vossenbergh, S. (2013). *Women entrepreneurship promotion in developing countries: What explains the gender gap in entrepreneurship and how to close it?* Maastricht: The Maastricht School of Management.
- Wolf, K., & Frese, M. (2018). Why husbands matter: Review of spousal influence on women entrepreneurship in sub-Saharan Africa. *Africa Journal of Management*, 4(1), 1-32.
- World Bank. (2019). *Profiting from parity: Unlocking the potential of women's business in Africa*. Geneva: World Bank.
- World Trade Organization. (2020). *Women and trade: The role of trade in improving gender equality*. Washington, DC: World Trade Organization.